The Role of Learning Progressions to Support the Development and Use of Mathematics Formative Assessment Tasks

E. Caroline Wylie
Educational Testing Service

TCCRISLS 2014
Acknowledgements

This work was done in collaboration with Malcolm Bauer and Meirav Attali.

The research reported here was supported by the Institute of Education Sciences, U.S. Department of Education, through Grant Reference R305A100518 to ETS.
Formative Assessment

Formative assessment is a process used by teachers and students during instruction that provides feedback to adjust ongoing teaching and learning to improve students’ achievement of intended instructional outcomes.

Learning Progressions
Learning Progressions

- A description of qualitative change in a student’s level of sophistication
Learning Progressions

• A description of qualitative change in a student’s level of sophistication

• Change in student standing on such a progression may be due to a variety of factors
Learning Progressions

• A description of qualitative change in a student’s level of sophistication
• Change in student standing on such a progression may be due to a variety of factors
• Each progression is presumed to be modal
Learning Progressions

• A description of qualitative change in a student’s level of sophistication
• Change in student standing on such a progression may be due to a variety of factors
• Each progression is presumed to be modal
• Finally, a progression is provisional, subject to empirical verification and theoretical challenge
Why Use Them?

Learning progressions (Heritage, 2008) can serve as a “cognitive lens” through which teachers can view student evidence to make hypotheses about students’ progress with respect to specific milestones, as well as their profile of partial understandings.
Interpretive Lens for Standards

6th grade
• Understand ratio concepts and use ratio reasoning to solve problems.

7th grade
• Analyze proportional relationships and use them to solve real-world and mathematical problems
Connecting Formative Assessment and Learning Progressions

Target the transition between levels

How to close the gap?

Where are students now?

What are the learning goals for my students?

Learning Progressions: long-term and short-term goals

Assessment tasks structured to target LP
Our Current IES Project

• Three learning progressions
  – Equality and Variable
  – Function and Linear Functions
  – Proportional Reasoning

• Two assessment formats
  – A “locator” test
  – Incremental tasks

• Three phases
  ✓ Phase 1: Development and early teacher feedback
  ✓ Phase 2: Validity studies
  ➔ Phase 3: Consequential validity study
# Proportional Reasoning Learning Progression

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Description of Levels</th>
<th>Student Strategies Associated with Levels</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Intuitive understanding, qualitative relationships</td>
<td>Absolute Reasoning Qualitative Reasoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Beginning quantification</td>
<td>Additive Misconception Reverses Ratios</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Multiplicative relationship</td>
<td>Build-up Strategy Cross-multiplication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Understands covariance and invariance</td>
<td>Scalar Strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Generalized model of proportionality, can work with more than two ratios</td>
<td>Successfully works with more than two ratios</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Proportional Reasoning Provisional Learning Progression

**Level 1**
- Has Intuitive Understanding

**Level 2**
- Begins to Quantify

**Level 3**
- Recognizes Multiplicative Relationship

**Level 4**
- Accommodates covariance and invariance
  - Student knows that if one number in a ratio changes that the other number must change by the same factor (that’s the covariance) and they know that equivalent ratios all reduce to the same ratio (that’s the invariance).
  - Student uses multiplication to generate equivalent ratios—e.g.,
    \[
    \frac{1}{2} = \frac{2}{4} = \frac{3}{6} = \frac{n}{2n}
    \]
  - Student’s notion of ratio starts to develop, he can work with one ratio but may have trouble comparing to another ratio. May have additive misconception—e.g.,
    \[
    \frac{1}{2} = \frac{1+1}{2+2} = \frac{2}{4} = \frac{2+1}{4+2} = \frac{3}{6}
    \]

**Level 5**
- Has Generalized Model
  - Student has a generalized model for solving proportionality problems. Student has a repertoire of strategies and uses the most efficient for a given situation. (Goes far beyond setting up proportion and cross multiplying.)

Locator Items

• Short computer-delivered assessment
• Focuses on one learning progression
• Overlapping forms of a locator test
  – Levels 1 to 3
  – Levels 3 to 5
• No single item will determine a student’s level but rather response patterns across a series of items
Brenda bought 20 pieces of candy with 12 quarters. Marisa has 15 quarters. How many pieces of candy can Marisa buy with her money? Explain how you found your answer.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Brenda bought 20 pieces of candy with 12 quarters. Marisa has 15 quarters. How many pieces of candy can Marisa buy with her money? Explain how you found your answer.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23 pieces. there is a rule and it is plus 8</td>
<td>Wrong additive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Brenda bought 20 pieces of candy with 12 quarters. Marisa has 15 quarters. How many pieces of candy can Marisa buy with her money? Explain how you found your answer.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23 pieces. there is a rule and it is plus 8</td>
<td>Wrong additive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 quarters is equal to 3 dollars. 300 pennies divided by 20 pieces of candy is equal to 15 cents per piece of candy. Marisa's 15 quarters are equal to $3.75 at 15 cents a piece she can get 25 pieces of candy</td>
<td>Unit Rate</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Brenda bought 20 pieces of candy with 12 quarters. Marisa has 15 quarters. How many pieces of candy can Marisa buy with her money? Explain how you found your answer.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23 pieces. there is a rule and it is plus 8</td>
<td>Wrong additive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 quarters is equal to 3 dollars. 300 pennies divided by 20 pieces of</td>
<td>Unit Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>candy is equal to 15 cents per piece of candy. Marisa's 15 quarters</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>are equal to $3.75 at 15 cents a piece she can get 25 pieces of candy</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 if you add 15 to 20 you get 35</td>
<td>Absolute reasoning</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Brenda bought 20 pieces of candy with 12 quarters. Marisa has 15 quarters. How many pieces of candy can Marisa buy with her money? Explain how you found your answer.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Code</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>23 pieces. there is a rule and it is plus 8</td>
<td>Wrong additive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12 quarters is equal to 3 dollars. 300 pennies divided by 20 pieces of candy is equal to 15 cents per piece of candy. Marisa's 15 quarters are equal to $3.75 at 15 cents a piece she can get 25 pieces of candy</td>
<td>Unit Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35 if you add 15 to 20 you get 35</td>
<td>Absolute reasoning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25 pieces of candy. for every three quarters its five pieces of candy so i just added five more pieces of candies</td>
<td>Grouping strategy</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Validity Studies

• Expert panel reviews of LPs
• Content analysis and review of tasks
  • Panels of 10 teachers, teacher educators and researchers per progression
  • Judgments of mapping tasks to levels
• Field Study
  • 9000 students
  • Item functioning, measurability of constructs, relation among constructs, form creation
Average difficulty (theta level) and variance for sets of items preclassified at each of the levels of the Proportional Reasoning Learning Progression.
Incremental Tasks

• Focus on:
  – One learning progression
  – One transition between two levels
  – One aspect of a transition in some cases

• Straddle the instruction-assessment line

• To be used flexibly in classrooms
# Level 1 to Level 2 Transition

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>From</th>
<th>Intuitive and qualitative comparison of more or less</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>To</td>
<td>Early attempt at quantifying and understanding the idea of ratio</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Level 1 to 2 Incremental Task

Part A
1. When the paint in each pan is mixed, which pan will hold the mixture that is a darker shade of blue? Explain your thinking.
2. Which pan has the greater quantity of blue paint? Explain your thinking.
Level 1 to 2 Task (cont.)

Part B
3. If pan A contains 1 cup of white paint, how many cups of blue paint does it contain? Explain your thinking.
4. What is the ratio of white paint to blue paint in pan A?
5. If pan B contains 2 cups of blue paint, how many cups of white paint do you think it contains? Explain your thinking.
6. Based on your answer to question 5, what is the ratio of white paint to blue paint in pan B?
How Can the Task be Used?

- With an individual student, small group or whole class
- Students complete a question, share it with group
- As a discussion starter

- To confirm hypothesis of level
- To identify need for instruction
- To identify who is ready for more challenging content
Learning Progressions and LOA?

- Learning progressions are relevant to all agents in LOA
  - Teachers, learners, standards, curriculum, assessment
Learning Progressions and LOA?

• Learning progressions are relevant to all agents in LOA
  – Teachers, learners, standards, curriculum, assessment

• Struggled in our work to make the learning progressions accessible to students
I can ...  
- Read a word problem and correctly identify the ratio  
- Use a variety of strategies to solve ratio problems  
  - Draw a picture  
  - Build-up strategy  
  - Cross-multiplication  
  - Scalar approach  
- Solve problems with more than two ratios  

**Student Self-Assessment Rubric**  

**Exceeds**  
I can do it without mistakes.  
I can help others.  

**Proficient**  
I can do it by myself!  
I make little mistakes.  

**Developing**  
Sometimes I need help.  
I am starting to understand.  

**Novice**  
I can't do it by myself.  
I don't understand yet.
Learning Progressions and LOA?

• Learning progressions are relevant to all agents in LOA
  – Teachers, learners, standards, curriculum, assessment

• Struggled in our work to make the learning progressions accessible to students

• Can we also capture potential language struggles within a topic represented by a learning
  – Discipline specific vocabulary
  – Discourse features
  – Other aspects
For further information contact:
ecwylie@ets.org